THE BEST CONFERENCE AND THE BEST STUDENT PAPER AWARD SELECTION PROCESS

June 2020

Enclosed is the outline of the process that has been followed in the past and was adopted for selecting best papers at SMC 2019, SMC 2018, and SMC 2019.

Award Selection Process is posted at:
http://ieeesmc.org/about-smcs/awards

The SMCS Society Awards Sub-Committee for Conferences is a Sub-Committee of the SMC Society Awards Committee.

The SMC Society Awards Committee deals with all SMC Society awards:
http://www.ieeesmc.org/about-smcs/awards
The last year's SMC Society Awards Committee members are listed at:
http://www.ieeesmc.org/about-smcs/governance/society-committees
Awards Committee
http://www.ieeesmc.org/about-smcs/governance/society-committees#awards

The SMC 20** Awards Sub-Committee only deals with the two paper awards:
Franklin V. Taylor Memorial Award
http://www.ieeesmc.org/about-smcs/awards/franklin-v-taylor-memorial-award
and
SMC Best Student Paper Award
http://www.ieeesmc.org/about-smcs/awards/conference-on-smc-best-student-paper-award

The SMCS Society Awards Chair selects members of the SMCS Society Awards Sub-Committee for Conferences (judges).

Composition of the SMC 20** Awards Sub-Committee:
http://www.ieeesmc.org/about-smcs/awards
Members of the IEEE International Conference on Systems, Man, and Cybernetics Organizing Committee are not eligible to serve on the subcommittees for selecting the finalists and winners of the two conference best paper awards. Hence, the SMC 20** organizing committee members such as the General Co-Chairs or the Program Chair cannot serve on the SMCS Society Awards Sub-Committee for Conferences in order to avoid any perceived conflict of interest:

The SMC 20** Awards Chair, should collect 15 best paper candidates and 15 best student paper candidates from the three Technical Program Track Co-Chairs.

Process for selecting the Franklin V. Taylor Memorial Award (best conference paper) and the SMC Best Student Paper Award:
Each of the three Technical Program Track Co-Chairs:

        Systems Science & Engineering
        Human-Machine Systems
        Cybernetics
should select 5 finalists for each track from the pool of accepted papers for each of the 2 awards.

The SMCS Society Awards Sub-Committee for Conferences (judges) will then select the 5 finalists for each award (out of the 15 papers submitted for each award).

The final lists of papers are to be approved by the BoG even if that has not always been done in practice:
        http://www.ieeesmc.org/about-smcs/awards

After listening to the oral presentations at SMC 20**, the 5 judges of the SMCS Society Awards Sub-Committee for Conferences will then select the winners for both the Franklin V. Taylor Memorial Award and the SMC Best Student Paper Award.

Note the general rules:
4. The Technical Program Track Co-Chairs of the current IEEE International Conference on Systems, Man, and Cybernetics are invited to submit nominations for the Franklin V. Taylor Memorial Award and the and the Best Student Paper Award.

7. The SMC Society Awards Chair forms a subcommittee for evaluation of the nominations and judging of the finalists for the Franklin V. Taylor Memorial Award and the IEEE International Conference on Systems, Man, and Cybernetics Best Student Paper Award. After the evaluation and judging is completed, names of the winners and basis for decisions are submitted to the SMC Society Awards Chair.

9. Recommended awards must be presented to the SMC Society Board of Governors (BoG) for endorsement. The BoG may reject a particular awardee by a 2/3 vote. If any awardee is rejected by the BoG, no substitute awardee shall be proposed or selected.

Room requirements:
We need one room over two time slots for the oral presentation of the best paper candidates:
- 1st session: Best student paper (5 papers):
        http://www.ieeesmc.org/about-smcs/awards/conference-on-smc-best-student-paper-award
- 2nd session: Best paper (5 papers):
        http://www.ieeesmc.org/about-smcs/awards/franklin-v-taylor-memorial-award

The two presentations should be scheduled on Tuesday morning (not in parallel) in time for the Committee to prepare awards to be given during the banquet. We will also need a room where the committee could meet to select the winners. This could be a separate smaller room that can fit 4/5 people.

Detailed steps (emphasis added):
----
1. The SMC 20** Awards Chair collects 5 papers from each of the three Technical Program Track Co-Chairs:
        Systems Science & Engineering
        Human-Machine Systems
        Cybernetics
for the Franklin V. Taylor Memorial Award and another 5 papers from each Track Co-Chair for the SMC Best Student Paper Award. Therefore, 15 papers are collected in total for each award.

General and Program Chairs should take care to not be involved in the selection of the papers to avoid any perceived conflict of interest.

2. Then, the SMC 20** Awards Chair sends the collected papers to the SMC Society Awards Chair to be evaluated by the SMCS Society Awards Sub-Committee for Conferences that is organized by to the SMC Society Awards Chair and consists of 5 judges.

3. The SMCS Society Awards Sub-Committee for Conferences will then select 5 papers (i.e., the finalists) for oral presentation for the Franklin V. Taylor Memorial Award and another 5 papers (i.e., the finalists) for oral presentation for the SMC Best Student Paper Award.

4. After listening to the oral presentations at SMC 20**, the 5 judges of the SMCS Society Awards Sub-Committee for Conferences will then select the winners for both the Franklin V. Taylor Memorial Award and the SMC Best Student Paper Award.

5. There is no certificate of merit, just a certificate for each of the finalists saying that they are a finalist of each award. The printed papers for the certificate of finalist and the 2 awards are prepared by the SMC 20** Organized Committee but have to be first approved by the Chair of the SMC Award Committee using the IEEE template for such awards.

_____
Notes:
The templates of the 2 awards are the same that IEEE prepared in previous years for the plaques of the winners. The certificate of finalists can be made similar to the ones used in Miyazaki, Budapest, or Banff.

Sometimes we only announced the names of the finalists and have them come to the stage for a picture but no certificate. I suggest that we prepare a finalist certificate because it costs us little and it is a big deal for those who get one.

_____